Bundesministerium Inneres



Plenary Session II: "Seen and Unseen Threats to Elections"



Austrian Experiences

Gregor Wenda Federal Ministry of the Interior Republic of Austria

> ACEEEO Annual Conference Vilnius, 6 September 2018



Bundesministerium Inneres

Table of Contents

- Introduction to Austria
- 2016 Presidential Elections & aftermath
- Lessons learned

Bundesministerium Inneres

Introduction to Austria

Republic of Austria

- Democratic republic (Federal President is head of state)
- Federal Parliament (bi-cameral = National Council & Federal Council)
- Approx. 84,000 km²
- 8,6 million inhabitants.
- 9 autonomous provinces (states)
- 2,098 municipalities





Nation-wide elections:

- National Council Elections ("parliamentary elections") à max. every 5 years; last: 15 October 2017
- Presidential Elections

 a every 6 years; last: 4 December 2016
- European Elections à every 5 years; last: 25 May 2014
- Referenda



Nation-wide elections:

- National Council Elections ("parliamentary elections") à max. every 5 years; last: 15 October 2017
- Presidential Elections
 à every 6 years; last: 4 December 2016
- European Elections à every 5 years; last: 25 May 2014
- Referenda

bmi.gv.at

Presidential Elections: Timeline

2016 Presidential election – the first 2 rounds



bmi.gv.at



Developments after 22 May

22/23 May
 May/June
 May/June
 Numerous allegations of criminal activities submitted to competent prosecutors' office, intense media focus
 8 June
 2nd round officially challenged, complete complaint also submitted to prosecutors' office
 1 July
 Constitution Court decision (written version on 13 July)



Constitutional Court Decision



Constitutional Court Proceedings (1)

- Constitutional Court has sole jurisdiction to decide about challenged elections in Austria.
- Decision rendered in less than 4 weeks (election challenged on 8 June, decision on 1 July).
- Only 2nd round of 22 May to be repeated.

Ruling of 1 July:

"Runoff election to the office of Federal President has to be repeated in its entirety all over Austria."

Constitutional Court Proceedings (2)

- Largest public hearing in history of Austria's Constitutional Court
- Court summoned 90 witnesses (and interviewed around 70)
- Behaviour in 14 districts found problematic





Bundesministerium Inneres

Court's Reasoning

1. District Electoral Authorities

- Infringements of the law occurred in 14 district electoral authorities (total of 77,929 postal votes concerned);
- difference between candidates Alexander van der Bellen and Norbert Hofer was only 30,863 votes
 à may have had "an influence on the election result"

2. Transmission of partial results

 Decision by FEB, partial results only transmitted to select media and universities to prepare pre-calculations
 à may have had "an influence on the election result"

"Stare decisis": Long line of Court decisions

- Laws governing elections must be strictly applied (generally no room for discretion; provisions must be interpreted by their literal meaning)
 à in order to exclude any abuse and manipulation.
- No need to proof any manipulations "if infringements of the law are of an extent that they may have had an influence on the election result" (first comparable decision rendered in 1927).

bmi.gv.at

Subsequent steps and repeat second round

Steps after Constitutional Court Decision (1)

- 8 July New e-day set for 2 October 2016
- 12 July
 Federal Electoral Board Meeting

training sessions for all subordinate electoral authorities requested (organized by different admin. levels)

no more internal transmissions of partial results

• 14 July

MOI requests provincial governments to examine professional behaviour of officials in districts Steps after Constitutional Court Decision (2)

- 25-26 August
 OSCE/ODIHR NAM in Austria
- 29 August Call center launched
- 6 September
 E-learning tool available online (two courses for district and local boards)
- 6 September
 Conference of Chairs of Provincial and
 District Electoral Boards at MOI

Problems with defective Voting Cards (Examples)



bmi.gv.at

Defective Voting Cards: Timeline

- Friday, 2 September: First report of defective voting card – additional reports over weekend
- Monday, 5 September: MOI orders check of all envelopes at municipalities before distribution
- Tuesday, 6 September: Meeting at MOI with election officials, presentation of E-Learning tool
- Following days: additional reports, pictures, complaints re: voting cards
- Friday, 9 September: Interior Minister announces press conference for Monday no sufficient legal basis for postponing presidential election

Postponing the Election

- Monday, 12 September: Interior Minister asks Parliament to enable postponement by passing an extraordinary law
- Tuesday, 13 September: 4 Parties submit bill proposing extraordinary statutes to postpone election day – discussed by Constitutional Committee on 15 September
- Wednesday, 21 September: Bill passed by National Council
- Monday, 26 September: Promulgation in Federal Law Gazette

Extraordinary Statutes: Legal Amendments

- Election day 2 October 2016 cancelled
- New election day (4 December 2016) and new cut-off day, new voter roll
- Introduction of new (old) envelope model à high stability

bhanden gekommene Wahlkarten darf die Gemeinde keinesfalls ersetzen!

Re-introducing "old" Voting Card Models

Aufreißlasche darf nur bei der Bedrissushibehörde gedfinet werden?	Nach Ihrer Stimmabgabe übermitte bite die gut verschlossene Wahkar Postweg (weitere Möglichkeine entre Sie dem Auftruck unter Punkt 1) so- zeitig an die umeets angeführte Be wahibehörde, dass ihr Einstreffen bei o spätestens am 2: Oktober 2016, 17.00 gewährleistet ist.	homen recht- szirks- fioser	M M M M M M M M M M M M M M M M M M M	Norvetzieteig	zweiten Wahlgang	Bundespräsidentenv	Any 3016
t Graz um umwehet de forgeneueten of te angeneueten of te angeneueten Oreitza Michaela	Wahtsprongel Cargo and a second secon	Rauen für Barcode oder OH-Code	Eides Mit r eider	GRAZ	Inliegenden amt- ich, unbeobachtet Ilt habe.	Brietwahi);	
ht vom Inland oder vom Ausland aus, ab E atte den anticken Stimmattel aus: aus anticken Stimmattel aus: aus anticken Stimmattel in das belagende de das belge farbene verschlossene Wah und das de Vanharte, verm Sis aur Stim und das de Vanharte, verm Sis aur Stim und das de Vanharte, verm Sis aur Stim das de Vanharte muss bezum Wahlteg d- inten Bezinswahlbehörde enlangen; uch in jedem Wahlbarde, so lange dieses p at auch durch eine von der Wahlteg i- uch in jedem Wahlbard, so lange dieses p	beige-farbene gummierte Wahlkuvert und kleben kuvert in dieses Wahlkurtenkuvert. Inhändige Unterschrift in der dafür vorgesehenen imabgabe mittels Briefwahl verwendet worder beinstangt. 2klober 2016), 17.00 Uhr, bei der auf der Rücks (2. Oktober 2016) bis 17.00 Uhr bei jeder Bezirk offnet hat, abgegeben werden. von dem Wähler beauftragte Person zulässig.	Sie dieses zu. Rubrik ab und n ist, rechtzei- ieite der Wahl- swahlbehörde	Graz. 15 Graz. 15 Graz. 15 Miti Ginner Wahikarda 1. Minista Briefwahi 14 * Lopen Sia de * Singen Sia de * Singen Sia de	And Dispensions and Dispension	s belagende beige-farbene gummierte Wa sseene Wahtkuvert in dieses Wahtkantenke tch ihre eigenhändige Uskerschrift in der di a sin zu	nnegen na son skon filt med og na son skon filt son skonster i ener Antesegensu: nde Weise abgeben: hiksvert und Vahan Sie die vert.	Placed of GP-Code CP-Code UV-R-Code UV-R-Codeson UV-R-Codeson UV-R-Codeson
bis zum 26. September 2016 abgeben (ichweich bis zum 23. September 2016), an e im Inland am Wahlflag: to die Wahlkarte, so wie Sie diese von de wie dem Wahlitener im Wahlfeiter eine Un hibidiausweite) von aus der ihrei Identhät e Osterreichs können Sie in jedem Wahl ingszeiten der Wahlflokale, such des zuständigen Wahlfokals am V it, sei es aus Krankheits-, Atters- oder noenenhäusen. Stratyvollzussanstalter	r Gemeinde erhalten haben, am Wahllag (2. kunde oder sonstige amtliche Bescheinigung inwandfrei ersichtlich ist. Jokal ihre Stimme abgeben. Beachten Sie bi Vahltag infolge mangeInder Geh- und Trans sonstigen Gründen, oder wegen Ihrer Unte h, im Maßnahmenvollzug oder in Hafträume rengel – falls eingerichtet – oder vor einer	Oktober 2016) (zum Beispiel itte die unter- portfähigkeit rbringung in n unmöglich	" "	he Appaer: die Wanitaarts koordense ge in Austandaut, so tung desse ge in Austandaut, so tung desse ge in Austand wird die Wahita more 2016 abgeben fass wir nörde im Inlaad auf wahitag in der im Inlaad auf wahitag is biste die Wahitarte, so wie wahita is der Wahitarten wird wahitag is der die Wahitarte, so wie so der Beach des zuständigen fare Beach des zuständigen gestentate – oder vor einer lien Ihnere:	na am Wakilagi (4 Deramber 2016) bis 17 Wakilari hat, abgeleben werden. Wakilarin oder von dem Wakilar beauftrag fle, venn Sis diese bei einer obstreichnis- rietungsbehölden außerheite des Europ elergreieht. Sis 6 diese von der Gemeinde erhalten m Wakilater eine Urkunde oder sonstig di ermandfrar erlichtlich ist. Sis in jedem Wakilaken ihre Sitmme nstigen Gründen, oder wegenste man unstigen Gründen, oder wegenste hate. Besonderen Wahilakalt	00 Uhr bei jeder Becklewa ne Person zulässig. hen Verürtlungsbehörde od laidchen Winischaftsnamm haben, am Wahltag (4. Di e amfliche Bescheinigung abgeben. Beachten Sie b einder Geb- und Transpo- terbringung berichtlic dannen Sie mit dieser Wä	er onner ottersichtechen Ein- in oder der Schweiz bis zum zember 2016) der Watheitur (zum Beitglich einen autlich itte die unterschiedlichen (tfähigkeit der Beitlägerige Maarte in einem Anstaltasse
 E-Mail: wahl@bmi.gv.at, Internetadres: Juropa, Integration und Außeres (Anschrift 	010 Wien. Telefon: 0800 20 22 20, [+431/01] se: www.bmi.gv.at/wahlen), . Minortenplatz 8, A-1010 Wien, Telefon: +43-(0) ; www.bmeia.gv.at/reise-aufenthat/leben-im-au:	501150-4400.	9042016-243 F-Mai		chrift: Herrangasse 7, 1010 Wien, Igv.al, Internetadresse: www.bml.gv.at and Außeres (Anschrift: Ninorteopiaze E afferses: www.bmeia.gv.at/reise-aufentha insulat, Konsulat).		

Managing the postponed repeat 2nd round (1)

- Risk assessment and risk management measures (with external advisors); complete evaluation of the election cycle
- Nation-wide E-learning tool, additional training sessions in all provinces
- Revised instructions and Guidelines by MOI
- Additional circular letters and decrees by Interior Ministry

Managing the postponed repeat 2nd round (2)

- Strongly intensified medial relations work (incl. social media)
- Call center stocked up
- Revised work-flow for inquiries via internet/e-mail
- New printing matters ordered valid contract with printing company but different company tasked with production of voting cards

Managing the postponed repeat 2nd round (3)

- Extra security measures for production/ transportation of new printing matters
- Additional quality control for voting card production
- Collection of defunct printing matters from authorities
- Research regarding cause of defective voting cards

Events following Presidential elections (1)

- 4 Dec. 2016: E-day for postponed repeat 2nd round
- 5/6 Dec. 2016: Final result à new President elected
- 27 Dec. 2016: Municipalities are granted extra lump sum per voter for expenses caused by repeat 2nd round and the postponement of the repeat 2nd round (special law passed)
- 26 Jan. 2017: Inauguration of new President
- Feb.- May 2017: Discussions about electoral law reform

- May 2017: Political consensus for early parliamentary elections (E-Day: 15 October 2017)
- July 2017: Out-of-court settlement between Republic of Austria and printing company;

Expert report of Fogra Research Institute of Digital Media Technologies held: "Election authorities not responsible for defective voting cards".

 Aug. 2018: Report of Court of Auditors à solid crisis management confirmed

Lessons learned (1)

- Full transparency ensures trust
- Monitoring tool in MOI for future elections
- Value of social media for fast communication
- Dual system of EMBs works well à challenge: Finding (voluntary) commission members

Bundesministerium Inneres

Lessons learned (2)

- E-Learning tool to be continued and expanded
- Need to introduce Centralized Electoral Register (in force since 1 January 2018); additional legal amendments to be discussed (electoral reform in current gov't program)
- Very detailed product descriptions for future printing matters tender; additional quality control for future productions
- "Robustness" and "resilience" of democracy; OSCE Report: Re-run "well prepared, efficient, transparent"

Thank You for Your Attention!

Contact:

Gregor Wenda Federal Ministry of the Interior Republic of Austria Department of Electoral Affairs

gregor.wenda@bmi.gv.at www.bmi.gv.at/wahlen bmi.gv.at